

June 27, 2025



**MINUTES OF THE RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE**

**These minutes are supplemented by the audio recording that is posted online at:
<https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents>.**

Honorable Board of Directors
Golden Gate Bridge, Highway
and Transportation District

Honorable Members:

The Rules, Policy, and Industrial Relations Committee/Committee of the Whole (Committee) of the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (District) met in regular session in the Board Room, Administration Building, Golden Gate Bridge Toll Plaza, San Francisco, CA, on Friday, June 27, 2025, at 9:00 a.m., with Vice Chair Moulton-Peters presiding. A remote audio option for public participation was available.

- (1) **Call to Order:** 9:00 a.m.
- (2) **Roll Call:** Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong. **[00:13 Minute Mark on the Audio Recording]**

Committee Members Present (8): Vice Chair Moulton-Peters; Directors Devlin, Hardeman, Garbarino, Hill, Pahre and Thier; President Cochran.

Committee Members Absent (1): Chair Hernández.

Other Directors Present (4): Directors Giudice, Mastin, Rabbitt, Rodoni and Snyder.

Committee of the Whole Members Present (13): Directors Devlin, Garbarino, Giudice, Hardeman, Hernández, Mastin, Moulton-Peters, Pahre, Rodoni and Thier; Second Vice President Rabbitt; First Vice President Hill; President Cochran.

Committee of the Whole Members Absent (4): Directors Engardio, Parrish, Sauter and Snyder.

[Note: On this date, there were two vacancies on the Board of Directors.]

Staff Present: General Manager Denis Mulligan; Auditor Controller Jennifer Mennucci; District Engineer John Eberle; Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong; Attorney Catherine Groves; Deputy General Manager/Bus Division Les Belton; Deputy General Manager/Ferry Division Michael Hoffman; Executive Administrator to the General Manager Justine Bock.

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

JUNE 27, 2025 /PAGE 2

Copies of all reports are available on the District's web site at <https://www.goldengate.org/district/board-of-directors/meeting-documents/> or upon request from the Office of the District Secretary.

- (3) **Rescind Resolution Nos. 2020-049 and 2023-010, Revise the Strategic Plan, and Authorize the General Manager to Take Any Other Actions Necessary to Comply with the Federal Transit Administration Master Agreement, Federal Highway Administration Grant Agreements and United States Department of Transportation Guidance** [01:04 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

General Manager Denis Mulligan presented the staff report.

Director Snyder inquired about the legal analysis involved in reaching this recommendation and the risks involved. Attorney Groves responded. He further commented that Directors are faced with a moral dilemma and after working on this funding for years is concerned with the risk of losing funding. He stated that there must another option where the District can still uphold its values and he was not comfortable with rescinding these resolutions, but the District cannot leave money on the table and we need to do what we can to ensure the safety of the Golden Gate Bridge (Bridge) and the public.

Director Giudice stated the choices before Directors are horrible and commented the Bridge is a symbol and can be considered the Statue of Liberty of the West Coast. He proposed a new resolution based on the District's values. Specifically, he stated, "That the District believes that every person has the right to be respected and to be safe. That the District and the Board of Directors shall honor compassion and the qualities of character that support equal justice and due process for all. That the Bridge is a universally beloved example of beauty, innovation and stands as a beacon to the world that represents the best of human endeavor, cooperation and unity. That the District commits their entire workforce to embrace a culture of belonging by building bridges towards one another, not away. Creating bonds of connection based on empathy, love for one another and understanding." He commented that culture isn't going anywhere and here to stay and asked his colleagues to take his statements as part of a new resolution for the Board of Directors to approve that does not conflict with the federal government.

Directors GIUDICE/GARBARINO moved and seconded to amend the staff recommendation and direct staff to immediately draft a new resolution to be present at the June 27, 2025 Board of Directors meeting that incorporates the principles he stated that upholds the District's value and complies with federal laws that will be read into the official record.

Director Garbarino thanked her colleagues for their comments and commented on the situation. She reiterated her support of the amended recommendation.

Director Hill concurred with the prior comments and cautioned that the District should be careful of wording of the new resolution. Mr. Mulligan responded.

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
JUNE 27, 2025 /PAGE 3

Director Thier stated her concern about returning with a resolution that the public has not seen and that the District should have placed it on the agenda for public review in advance for comment. She further stated that the promise of the American Dream does not depend on who is in office and the best way to get the administration's attention is to put it on the agenda. She also stated that the Bridge is a symbol of democracy and diversity and inclusion and she is concerned that other demands via Executive Order could be coming. She understands her colleagues want to fix this and is unclear if she will support what is presented and shared her concerns on the process. Mr. Mulligan and Attorney Groves responded.

Director Pahre stated she did not see much difference in the way the District does business since the time the original 2020 resolution was signed until now. She further stated the District is an organization with great integrity and cares deeply about people. She understood Director Thier's concerns about the public process but wanted to know the downside of approving staff's recommendation and then bringing back a new resolution that Directors can then consider later if time allows. Mr. Mulligan responded.

Director Rabbitt commented that many are not comfortable with what is before the Board and spoke about Sonoma County's similar effort and the unfairness of the issue. He stated that he would not request staff to sign a document that puts them at risk. He added that the discretionary grant is only one of four that were awarded and the District could lose that funding. He further stated that this is an iterative process and may not be the last time the District does this but supported changing the wording to allow staff to sign the agreements.

Director Thier requested that the proposed rescinded resolutions be distributed with the new resolution.

[31:08 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

The following individuals spoke under public comment:

- Michael Thériault, former member of the Board of Directors (in person)
- Aleta Dupree, Team Folas (remotely)

MOTION TO AMEND RECOMMENDATION

Directors GIUDICE/GARBARINO moved and seconded a motion to amend the original staff recommendation to include language from proposed rescinded resolutions in a new resolution to be presented before the Board of Directors for consideration.

AYES (13): Directors Devlin, Garbarino, Giudice, Hardeman, Mastin, Moulton-Peters, Pahre, Rodoni, Snyder and Thier; Second Vice President Rabbitt; First Vice President Hill; President Cochran.

NOES (0): None.

ABSENT (4): Directors Engardio, Hernández, Parrish and Sauter.

Director Thier requested clarification and stated that she would not support moving the new resolution to the Board of Directors for consideration. She also requested a copy of any comments received on this matter.

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
JUNE 27, 2025 /PAGE 4

(a) Action by Committee

Staff recommended and the Committee concurred by motion made and seconded by **Directors GIUDICE/GARBARINO** to forward the following recommendation to the Board of Directors for its consideration:

RECOMMENDATION

The Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee recommends the Board of Directors approve actions, contingent on additional terms that were discussed at the Committee meeting which will be included in a new resolution to be considered by the Board of Directors, as follows:

- (i) Rescind Board Resolution No. 2020-049;
- (ii) Rescind Board Resolution No. 2023-010;
- (iii) Revise the Final 2024 Strategic Plan; and,
- (iv) Authorize the General Manager to take any other actions necessary to ensure the Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District is in compliance with the Federal Transit Administration Master Agreement 33, as may be superseded by future versions, and Federal Highway Administration grant agreements, and United States Department of Transportation guidance.

Action by the Board at its meeting of June 27, 2025 – Resolution

AYES (12): Directors Devlin, Garbarino, Giudice, Hardeman, Mastin, Moulton-Peters, Pahre, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Rabbitt; First Vice President Hill; President Cochran.

NOES (1): Director Thier.

ABSENT (4): Directors Engardio, Hernández, Parrish and Sauter.

(4) Approve an Amendment to the Rules of the Board regarding Meetings (Rule II, Section A) [44:10 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

Secretary of the District Amorette Ko-Wong presented the staff report.

Director Thier inquired about emergency circumstances, shared her concern that this would limit a director's participation and potential violation of the Brown Act rules. Ms. Ko-Wong, Mr. Mulligan and Attorney Groves responded.

Director Rabbitt commented about his experience as a representative of a regional Board and challenges with remote participation for those meetings. He stated his concern on whether the public truly has access.

(a) Action by Committee

Staff recommended and the Committee concurred by motion made and seconded by

RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
JUNE 27, 2025 /PAGE 5

Directors MASTIN/GIUDICE to forward the following recommendation to the Board of Directors for its consideration:

RECOMMENDATION

The Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee recommends that the Board of Directors approve an amendment to the *Rules of the Board* regarding Meetings (Rule II, Section A), as follows and as provided in the attachment to this staff report:

(AMENDED) RULE II, THE RULES OF ORDER, Section A. Meetings:

“The Board shall convene in regular meeting at 10:00 a.m. on the fourth Friday of each month in the District's San Francisco headquarters, except in May, November and December, as outlined in the meeting calendar approved by the Board on an annual basis. (Res. 2021-085, 11/19/21.) In each calendar year the Board may hold one or more regular meetings in each of the other five counties of the District. (Res. 88-11, 1/29/88.)

Meetings may be held by teleconference and Directors may participate in meetings remotely, as permitted by the Ralph M. Brown Act and as authorized by state law, subject to the requirements of this section. Directors may participate in meetings remotely pursuant to the Brown Act's traditional teleconference rules (Government Code Section 54953(b)) only under the following conditions:

1. The Director has submitted a request to participate remotely to the District Secretary's Office containing the information necessary to facilitate remote participation no less than nine (9) days before the meeting; and,
2. Remote participation is necessary to reach a quorum or to provide a reasonable accommodation to the Director under the Americans with Disabilities Act (42 USC § 12101).

This policy applies to all Board meetings subject to the Ralph M. Brown Act, including but not limited to standing committee meetings of the Board. This policy does not affect Directors' ability to participate in meetings remotely for "just cause" or due to "emergency circumstances" under Government Code Section 54953(f)(2)(A)(i-ii).

The President, in consultation with the General Manager, may cancel a regularly scheduled meeting of the Board of Directors if there are no items requiring Board review or action to the next regularly scheduled Board of Directors meeting. (Res. 2009-018, 2/27/09.)”

Action by the Board at its meeting of June 27, 2025 – Resolution

AYES (12): Directors Devlin, Garbarino, Giudice, Hardeman, Hernández, Mastin, Pahre, Rodoni and Snyder; Second Vice President Rabbitt; First Vice President Hill; President Cochran.

NOES (1): Director Thier.

ABSENT (4): Directors Engardio, Hernández, Parrish and Sauter..

**RULES, POLICY AND INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE/COMMITTEE OF
THE WHOLE
JUNE 27, 2025 /PAGE 6**

(5) Public Comment

There were no public comments.

(6) Adjournment [55:17 Minutes Mark on the Audio Recording]

All business having been concluded the meeting adjourned at 9:56 a.m.

Carried

Respectfully submitted,



Stephanie Moulton-Peters, Vice Chair
Rules, Policy and Industrial Relations Committee

SMP:AMK:tnm